Eva ANGLESSY   **N° étudiant : xxxxxxx**

Université de Lorraine ERUDI

Session April 2021

Master Anglais

N802A-Littérature

Domaine : Arts, Lettres, Langues
Mention : LCE (Langues et Cultures Etrangères)
Spécialité : Mondes anglophones

Dossier Maison noté à rendre pour le 5 avril 2021

This dossier is composed of three documents of a very different nature. Document A is the very beginning of *The Alienated Manor*, a drama written in 1798 by a long-forgotten Scottish author, Joanna Baillie. In Act I scene 1, Crafton, a Scot whose uncle was dispossessed of his land and manor by the present owner, Charville, discusses with Sir Level, an English landscape architect hired by Charville "to improve the pleasure grounds" according to "the modern taste". When Crafton teases the architect by asking him if his last work in the North (Lochaber) went according to his plans, Sir Level replies that the natural stream there was too "obstinate", too rebellious to allow him to implement his artistic design. Document B is a photographic artwork created in 2015, *Portrait of Charles Edward Stuart (after William Mosman)* by the Scottish artist Calum Colvin. He transformed Mosman's original painting of Bonnie Prince Charlie, the hero of the 1745 uprising, into a constructed trompe-l'oeil where the portrait is superposed on decaying symbols of the Highlands in a dilapidated room. Document C is an extract from a travelogue, *A Tour thro' the whole Island of Great Britain*, written by Daniel Defoe in 1724-27, in which he describes Fort William, built and maintained by the successive English governments to "curb the Highlanders". These three documents raise the issue of the cultural alterity of the Highlanders in relation to wider Scottish and British national identities. I will tackle this question of otherness in studying how it was built by outsiders upon the Highlanders' loyalty to the Stuarts and historical resistance towards the British crown until the Jacobite rebellions in the 18th century, and how this rebellious spirit and its consequences are represented in these three pieces of literature and pictorial art.

The three documents revolve around or allude to Lochaber in the North of Scotland, the historical country of Clan Cameron, who, together with many other clans, remained deeply loyal to the Stuarts (after Charles I's execution in 1649 then James II's eviction in 1688) and rebelled against the British crown since the 17th century. Lochaber became a symbol of the Highlanders' identity. In Baillie's drama and Defoe's report, the rebellious character of the

Highlanders mirrors the description of the Highlands natural wilderness, be it the impetuous stream that no spade would contend or the "wild, untaught, or untractable inhabitants". During the 1770s, Horace Walpole promoted a new style of gardening in England, whose aim was to free the garden to return closer to nature, as an antidote to the high formal geometrical gardening practices in France: 'The gentle stream was taught to serpentize seemingly at its pleasure (…)'[1]. Baillie ironically puts Walpole's words into Sir Level's mouth, opposing the managed naturalness of the improver's plans to Crafton's preference for the "sylvan beauty" of his forefathers' land (humorously expressed through the similes: gentleman/untamed clown or posture master/savage chief) and to the stubborn "burn" on the Glenvorluch estate in Lochaber. The same opposition may be found in Defoe's text, in which the wild mountains of the North are opposed to the "fruitful valleys intersperst among the hills" watered by the Tay, closer to the 18th century moral qualities of Englishness: comfort, control and moderation[2]. Interestingly, in both texts, this view of Highland alterity is expressed by Englishmen (the landscape architect in the drama and Defoe himself in his travelogue).

The artificial "improvement" of natural land along fashionably picturesque lines in 18th century Britain finds an echo in the sophisticated way Colvin recently reinterpreted Mosman's original painting of Bonnie Prince Charlie, "exploring the complex legacy and secret symbolism of the Jacobite rising[3]". Moreover, the use of Highlander stereotypes in Colvin's work points towards the idea that Highlanders' identity has been forced upon them and constructed by outsiders through "a powerful Victorian iconography of tartanry"[4]. The portrait of the archetypal Highland 'king' superimposed over the heap of objects represents the role of portraiture in the construction of Bonnie Prince Charlie's legend – but also the role of the arts in trying to define a Highland identity. If we examine the background of the picture, we can see

[1] Lecture « English Landscape: The Picturesque », by Professor Malcom Andrews, Gresham College, 25 October 2017, https://www.gresham.ac.uk/lectures-and-events/english-landscape-the-picturesque
[2] Ibid
[3] http://www.calumcolvin.com/Jacobites_by_Name.html
[4] The expression comes from Penny Fielding's article about Robert Louis Stevenson, class 802-Literature.

the painter's brushes jutting from a toby jug (a distinctly English form of pottery), and in the mirror, three blank (Guy Fawkes style) masks are reflected around the artist's face[5] – leading the viewer to the concept of a created image. More than the Scottish Enlightenment and the extraordinary intellectual and economic boom of Scotland since the second half of the 18th century, the Romantic myth of the Jacobite uprising created by 19th century artists -- as in Scott's *Waverley*, Stevenson's *Kidnapped* or the erection of the iconic Glenfinnan Monument in 1815 -- contributed to establish an identity for the Scottish Highlands.

Baillie's drama also deals with the dispossession of Crafton's land by Charville and the "improvement" of land as "a range of practice from enclosure to clearance that were notoriously destructive"[6]. She may implicitly refer to the Highland clearances and to the draconian legislation after the Jacobite defeat at Culloden in 1746: estates were forfeited, land belonging to the chiefs of clans was put in the hands of lowlanders, and it became illegal to wear highland dress. It was an attempt by the Hanoverian government to destroy the clan system of society across the Highlands. The Highlands economic decline and depopulation, the harsh repression of the Highlanders' power and identity as a consequence of their 1745 uprising, are represented in Colvin's picture through the decay of the stag head[7] (the stag is emblematic of the majesty of Scotland's Highlands and wildlife), the waste of grain (agricultural resources) and the general dilapidated state of the room. In the middle of this room, if the Prince wears the tartan, the Jacobite blue bonnet with a white cockade and the Order of the Garter -- all emblems of his legitimacy as Scottish and British king, and Jacobite leader -- his smiling portrait seems to float preternaturally as a ghost. The Highlanders' loyalty to the last Stuart, heir of the British crown, and their subsequent brutal repression by the Hanoverian kings ruined them: many had to flee

---

[5] These details are visible when looking closely the picture directly on Calum Colvin's site: http://www.calumcolvin.com/Jacobites_by_Name.html

[6] "Improving the Law: Property Rights and Self-Possession in Joanna Baillie's *The Alienated Manor*", by Regina Hewitt, 2007. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24043957

[7] Especially when compared to '*Portrait of Charles Edward Stuart (after Liotard)*' by Calum Colvin, in which there is a taxidermy stag head mounted on the wall: http://www.calumcolvin.com/Jacobites_by_Name.html

the country or keep their enduring admiration secret, as suggested by the cylindrical mirror for anamorphic paintings and the picture on the easel turned towards the wall, in Colvin's picture.

To conclude, this dossier points out how outsiders created "the myth of Highlandism"[8], an identity for the Scottish Highlands in relation to Scottish and British national identities. The Highlanders' cultural alterity was thus built on the wilderness of the natural geography, their historical loyalty to the Stuarts and subsequent rebellions against the British crown during the 17th and 18th centuries. After the Hanoverian repression and their economic decline in the second half of the 18th century, the Highlands recovered a wide appeal to the imagination of British people during the 19th century, through the Romantic impulse of Scottish writers and the interest developed by Queen Victoria in the Highlands traditions, landscape and wildlife. Today the Highlands promote the natural beauty and wilderness of the mountains as a touristic argument, using their alterity as an asset in a country otherwise densely populated and urbanized.

---

[8] Cf. Penny Fielding's article about Robert Louis Stevenson, class 802-Literature